



BROOKLINE POLICE DEPARTMENT

Office of Professional Responsibility

SUPT MARK P. MORGAN
ACTING CHIEF OF POLICE

PAUL R. CAMPBELL
LIEUTENANT

To: Superintendent Mark Morgan

From: Lieutenant Paul Campbell

Date: June 13, 2018

Subject: CIMS Audit

Pursuant to Special Order 2010-4 III(c)(3), I conducted an audit of the Brookline Police Department Critical Infrastructure Monitoring System. The CIMS policy requires that the Office of Professional Responsibility conduct a semi-annual audit to determine compliance with this policy and also to ensure that CIMS records are complete and up to date.

The CIMS system consists of 11 cameras set up in various locations throughout the Town of Brookline. The policy requires training of Officers and Dispatchers prior to receiving codes to access the system. The policy also requires records be kept regarding use of the system as well as requests for production of captured video. Additionally, a camera inventory log must be maintained documenting that the cameras are inspected monthly. As part of the camera inventory logs the location of the cameras as well as dates placed in service are recorded.

The CIMS camera policy calls for the cameras to operate every day between the hours of 10 PM – 6 AM. During those hours the cameras are to be automatically turned on via computer. From 6 AM until 10 PM, the same computer is supposed to close a “mask” over the cameras, effectively taking them offline. During this time, the cameras are unable to monitor or record anything. During 2015, the CIMS cameras reached their end of life, and the decision was made to replace the cameras. At present time, 10 of the 11 CIMMs cameras have been replaced, with the only exception being the camera at Boylston/Hammond. The Boylston/Hammond camera is currently not working due to Wi-Fi network issues. This camera has been out of service since June of 2015. In my prior audits I reported that I’d spoken with Officer Scott Wilder from the IT division and was advised that there are significant technology issues related to this camera and its location. Officer Wilder informs me that the problem with the signal to this camera is scheduled to be addressed in July of 2018, and it is expected that this camera should be operational again before the end



of the summer. An exact date is not known at this time. The camera is currently one of the old Bosch cameras and is past its end of life period. The camera will be replaced with a newer model when the connections are addressed. As with the other CIMS cameras, the new camera will not have a Situcon cover to shroud the video between the hours of 6 AM and 10 PM. None of the town cameras have working Situcon covers, and as such all cameras operate 24 hours a day. This has been the case since 2015.

Video Recording Production Requests

The Technology Division maintains a log documenting each request made for a copy of a video captured by the CIMS cameras. Requests for video are submitted to Officer Scott Wilder, who retains a hard copy of each request. Additionally he logs data associated with the request, including date/time of incident, type of incident, location, case # if applicable, date request filled and any additional remarks to explain the nature of the request.

I inspected this log and determined it to be organized and up to date. Since January 1, 2018 there have been 21 requests for production of video captured by the CIMS camera system. 14 of these video requests were made by law enforcement personnel for law enforcement reasons, while 7 requests were public records requests. Four of the 7 public records requests were made related to one incident, a serious motor vehicle crash (investigating officer, insurance company, both operators/representatives).

All 7 video requests made by civilians were filled. Of the 21 total requests for video, 18 were actually accommodated. The remaining requests were not filled because the cameras did not record any video of value.

Below is a list of the CIMS camera video requests for this audit period.

Date of Incident	Time of Incident	Type of Incident	Turned Over To
1/16/2017	2300 hrs.	MV Hit & Run	N/A – Nothing in view of camera
1/31/2018	1930 to 2030 hrs	public record request	Public Records Request
2/15/2018	0640 hrs	MV Crash - involving 542 marked vehicle	Traffic Investigator and Evidence
2/19/2018	1740 hrs	OUIL	Evidence
3/7/2018	1830 hrs	public record request	Records
3/7/2018	1455 hrs	public record request	Records
3/18/2018	0140 hrs	OUIL - red light	Evidence
3/21/2018	1340 hrs	MV stop	Evidence
4/6/2018	1830 hrs	A&B, Civil Rights	Evidence



4/9/2018	1300 hrs	B&E MV	Evidence
4/12/2018 to 4/13/2018	1800 to 0800 hrs	B&E	Detective O'Leary
4/17/2018	0750 hrs	MV Crash	Evidence
4/17/2018	0750 hrs	MV Crash	Public Records Request
4/17/2018	0750 hrs	MV Crash	Public Records Request
5/2/2018	0850 hrs	MV Crash	Office Cheung
5/6/2018	1216 hrs	Larceny \ flim flam	N/A – Out of view of camera
5/4/2018	0001 to 0120 hrs	Armed Home invasion	Detective Kelliher
5/30/2018	1720 hrs	MV crash, town property	Evidence
5/2/2018	0850 hrs	MV crash	Public Records Request
6/5/2018	2130 hrs	Armed Robbery (Boston)	N/A – Boston PD looking for video. Nothing found on cameras
4/17/2018	0750 hrs	MV Crash	Public Records Request

Camera Inventory and Inspection

Under the policy it is required that the camera system be inspected monthly by the Technology Division. Additionally the Technology Division must maintain a log inventorying all cameras in service, including the date each camera is placed in service, location, inspection dates, maintenance/repair history and specific activities being monitored if any.

The log detailing this information is kept in the Larimore property system. A separate log is maintained for each camera. The information contained in the logs is complete and easily accessible. I checked the logs and found the information to be clear and up to date. The cameras have been inspected as required. Where issues were discovered they were noted in the inspections as well as the repairs undertaken to correct these issues.

Certification/Training

Prior to receiving an access code to operate the CIMS camera system, Department Employees are required to receive a copy of the policy for the CIMS cameras. Employees must also receive training in the policy, with a focus on impermissible uses. Once this is done, employees then sign a certification that they have received and read the Special Order regarding the CIMS camera system (S.O. 2010-4).



This certification/training component of the Special Order is being adhered to. Department personnel have all been provided a copy of the policy. Additionally, the policy is available to all department personnel at any time via the Department's internal file storage system. The entire Department was trained in the camera system and impermissible uses at the time the cameras were installed. CIMS policy training is provided to new hires prior to their being provided an access code to the system. Signed certifications are maintained within the training division. The training notebook with all certifications was readily available, and as new employees are hired their certifications are added to the notebook for easy review. I verified that the newest dispatchers have all been trained, and confirmed that they have signed certifications documenting that they have received training pursuant to SO 2010-4. All police officers have been trained as well, with the exception of a new police officer who was sworn in last week. He is still in the training phase of his employment and is expected to receive his CIMS camera training sometime this week.

Complaints/Misuse

There have been no complaints, either internal or external related to misuse of the CIMS camera system. Since the inception of the CIMS camera system, there has never been an allegation of impermissible use of this system.

Conclusion

Based on my audit the cameras are being used lawfully and for appropriate purposes. The camera records are being maintained and are up to date and organized. Officers are being educated on the policy regarding the use and impermissible uses of the CIMS camera system, and after reviewing these policies they sign a certificate acknowledging they have been trained regarding the CIMS camera system. These training records are being properly maintained and updated. The CIMS camera system is not in compliance with the CIMS policy regarding the Situcon covers, which is something that is well-known. The cameras record 24 hours a day. This fact has been reported in a number of my previous audits as well as been discussed by the Brookline Select Board at meetings, and has also been reported publicly in the Brookline Tab. We do not use the Situcon covers any longer and have not used them in several years. As of the current time the policy still includes language regarding the physical covering of the cameras. As I have written previously, it is worth considering removing this language from the policy.

Respectfully submitted,



Lieutenant Paul Campbell
Office of Professional Responsibility

